# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOREWORD</td>
<td>05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND</td>
<td>07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENVIRONMENTAL OVERVIEW</td>
<td>09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADVERTISING AND FINANCIAL SUPPORT</td>
<td>09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIGITAL TECHNOLOGIES</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONTENT</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MONITORING</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Following a period of technological upheaval, the media environment in North America is now experiencing a period of financial turbulence along with a redefinition of its mandates and audiences.

Advertising revenue is gravitating towards internet services; audiences want access to news stories with the immediacy of social media. Those are but two of the many factors that are challenging the financial and editorial models on which media operations were based up until now.

Ontario’s Francophone media are also facing financial realities that make their already complex situation even more precarious, given that their audiences are minority communities with lesser numbers, although some newspapers do serve regions with high concentrations of Francophones.

Moreover, Ontario’s Francophone media are either not-for-profit organizations or privately owned. Whatever their legal status, the future of Ontario’s Francophone media is a concern for the Assemblée de la francophonie de l’Ontario (AFO) throughout its territory, given their importance as an element of shared identity for the community as a whole.

The main challenges faced by Francophone media in Ontario are those that are affecting the media environment in general. Major reductions in government advertising, along with a decreased advertising market, are undermining a major source of revenue. Another factor is the recurring costs of full transition to digital technologies, which has repercussions that are no longer just informational, but also functional.

As they compete with social media and the instantaneous news they provide, the media in majority communities are striving to redefine themselves and reposition the relevance of their content. As for Ontario’s Francophone media, they are already well focused on their specific mission and audience and are staying the course, a position which gives them a degree of strength in the face of the challenges they are addressing.

A question that was raised by many community stakeholders, which this document echoes, concerns opportunities to share content between media in a given region (e.g. newspaper/radio), be they of the same type (e.g. radio/radio) or of different types (e.g. television/newspaper). There have been some developments in this direction. Would it be possible to go further, insofar as it benefits the community as a whole?

Many paths forward have been proposed to improve the situation. Some involve government; others involve media operations as such. For a few specific issues, in order to provide ongoing supervision, the creation of an audience and policy monitoring organization would help to ensure the long term existence of present and future Francophone media in Ontario.
FOREWORD

Ours is certainly not the first study focusing on the Francophone media environment. Respected academics, such as Simon Laflamme, Rodrigue Landry and others, have written on this topic in recent years. Their analyses, which focus on the relevance of French language media and their impact on their communities, serve as a backdrop for this document.

In an article published in the journal Minorités linguistiques et société, Christiane Bernier, Simon Laflamme and Sylvie Lafrenière state the following: “Our analysis demonstrates that, within Francophone minorities, access to a high number of French language media positively affects linguistic choices: the more French language media are present in their environment, the more Francophones make use of them.”

On that point, the researchers and experts who were consulted for the present study are unanimous. So, why is a White Paper now devoted to the Franco-Ontarian media environment? Ontario’s Francophone media are immersed in a global media context that is undergoing technological, economic and editorial transformation. The impact of this transformation is undermining the position of Francophone media, which is already weakened by a major reduction in government advertising revenue, as evidenced by complaints submitted to Canada’s Commissioner of Official Languages and Ontario’s French Language Services Commissioner.

By informing the Franco-Ontarian community about the realities of the media environment that are specific to French Ontario, mobilizing the community around a shared vision and listing the challenges that Ontario’s Francophone media are facing, this White Paper on Ontario’s Francophone media aims to provide a clear understanding of the situation, the strategic issues and the measures that could be taken to ensure the implementation of winning strategies.

This White Paper touches on all Francophone media based and managed in French Ontario, be they public, not-for-profit or private. This includes newspapers, radio stations and television stations. It discusses the issues related to media as organizations, but does not discuss newsrooms. Journalistic integrity was respected in the preparation of this White Paper.

Ontario’s Francophone media are knowledgeable about their own situation. They were therefore invited to take part in consultations leading up to this White Paper. Interviews were conducted, briefs were submitted and consultation sessions were held. The media themselves have thus provided an essential contribution to this White Paper. The identified issues and proposed solutions are based on information provided by actors in the media environment and expressed by various stakeholders in the consultation sessions.

Also, following complaints received from various stakeholders, the Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada recently published a preliminary report on the role of the Government.

1 Christiane Bernier, Simon Laflamme et Sylvie Lafrenière, L’effet de la disponibilité des médias et de la densité de la population minoritaire sur la langue d’exposition aux médias, Minorités linguistiques et société, no 3, 2013, p. 138.
of Canada with regards to the challenging economic situation faced by Francophone media in minority settings. A similar complaint was submitted to the Office of the French Language Services Commissioner of Ontario and a report is expected in the summer of 2017.

A three-phase consultation process was conducted to produce this White Paper.

In the first phase, three consultation sessions were held with representatives of Ontario’s Francophone media. Two consultations were held during meetings of the provincial round table on Francophone media (November 2016 and March 2017) and another session was held in Toronto in January 2017.

In the second phase, interviews were conducted with persons involved at various levels with Francophone media in Ontario (see Table 1). These interviews provided more detailed qualitative information. The data obtained in these interviews was analyzed to identify trends derived from elements provided by the interview participants in response to open questions.

Recently, the community was invited to provide comments on their perception of the future of media by submitting a brief of no more than five pages. Nine (9) such briefs were received.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 1 – INTERVIEW PARTICIPANTS, BY CATEGORY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic researchers and persons responsible for post-secondary programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representatives of advocacy groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representatives of media advocacy groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directors of Francophone media organizations in Ontario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders with backgrounds in Francophone media in Ontario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders involved with non-traditional media</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 2 – BRIEFS RECEIVED, BY CATEGORY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders concerned by the topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School boards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media entities in French Ontario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural organizations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BACKGROUND

The traditional media environment is in the throes of change and/or adaptation, while the social media and online media environment is in full expansion. The business model of traditional media is weakening, yet the business model of online media remains uncertain. Traditional media are losing substantial advertising revenues, which leads to the elimination of professional jobs, while online media are not yet attracting enough advertising revenue to flip the scales and recruit the talent and expertise that their competitors have lost. As Bob Cox and Edward Greenspon have noted, “(e)ven large international media groups are not attracting enough viewers to their ads or online subscriptions to support their newsrooms.”

National and provincial players have sounded the alarm, not only for their financial survival, but also because lost talent inevitably means less editorial content and possibly lower journalistic standards. Fewer professional journalists are on the ground and fewer professional editors are verifying the political and economic facts, so not only is there less information, but also a greater risk of incorrect or even ‘alternative’ information. This represents a crisis for democracy, as discussed by participants in the Public Policy Forum and in the report The Shattered Mirror.

In this multi-dimensional playing field, where are Ontario’s Francophone media positioned? In 2016, the Assemblée de la francophonie de l’Ontario discussed this question, which is certainly not trivial.

Generally speaking, the institutional situation in French Ontario has much improved since the adoption of the Canadian constitution in 1982 and Ontario’s French Language Services Act in 1989. Many new elementary and secondary French language schools have appeared alongside existing schools. Ontario has created the Office of Francophone Affairs, Francophone community colleges, French language schools boards and the position of French Language Services Commissioner, has granted autonomy to TFO and has continued to designate additional agencies and organizations under the French Language Services Act, etc.

Meanwhile, the situation of Ontario’s Francophone media has weakened. Société Radio-Canada’s operations in Ontario are facing financial instability along with reduced airtime, while traditional media are generally facing challenging financial conditions. Over the past ten years, governmental strategy has been to transfer advertising placement from traditional media to online platforms and this has had a disrupting effect on traditional media.

Nevertheless, the importance of French language media in minority settings as a means of ensuring integration and participation in the Franco-Ontarian community is well recognized.


3 Extrait du rapport Le miroir éclaté : nouvelles, démocratie et confiance dans l’ère numérique, rapporté dans La Presse+, février 2017.
and more important than ever, as stated by Landry, Deveau and Allard: “Our research has demonstrated that contact with these media is specifically associated with the desire to be part of the minority community, but also with ethno-linguistic identity.”

The newspaper Le Droit is an excellent example of this sort of societal impact. Founded in 1913 in reaction to the adoption of Regulation 17, which banned the use of the French language in Ontario schools that had been Francophone schools up until that point, Le Droit has played a role in all of French Ontario’s major battles, from Regulation 17 to Montfort Hospital, and remains to this day Ontario’s only French language daily newspaper. Over time, Le Droit has had to reduce its regional presence throughout Ontario, but it remains the Francophone media of reference for the populous Ottawa-Gatineau region.

This White Paper on Francophone media in Ontario aims to raise awareness of the realities these media are facing and, most importantly, to identify strategies to ensure their survival and development.

In their study, Laflamme and Lafrenière examine three questions:

The first involves accessibility: are minority language media present everywhere in Canada? What is important to determine in this respect is whether it can be said that the availability of such media is sufficient in every province or territory. The second involves the content presented by these media: generally speaking, does it relate to their audience? In other words, is a sufficient amount of their content a reflection of the communities these media are serving? These two topics of discussion lead to a third question, which addresses the federal government’s responsibilities regarding the delivery of media services to official language minority communities.

The deliberate use of the word “sufficient” when considering both quantity and quality of services is important for the purpose of this White Paper and the reference to the role of the State is important as well. This brings us to our analysis of the media environment. In our discussion of the role of the State, it should be noted that both the Government of Ontario and the Government of Canada are concerned.

5 Christiane Bernier, Simon Laflamme et Sylvie Lafrenière, L’effet de la disponibilité des médias et de la densité de la population minoritaire sur la langue d’exposition aux médias, Minorités linguistiques et société, no 3, 2013, p. 123.
ENVIRONMENTAL OVERVIEW

The Environmental Overview section sets the stage for the section that follows, in the sense that its content is organized around the main issues facing Ontario’s Francophone media. The main issues are:

- Advertising and financial support
- Digital technologies
- Content
- Monitoring

ADVERTISING AND FINANCIAL SUPPORT

GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING

In 2016, complaints were lodged regarding the drastic reduction in government advertising placement. One was with the Office of the Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada, the other with the Office of the French Language Services Commissioner of Ontario.

The complaint submitted by the Assemblée de la francophonie de l’Ontario contains this statement:

*The Assembly has analyzed the Annual Report on Government of Canada Advertising Activities published by Public Services and Procurement Canada (PSPC, formerly PWGS) for the years 2002-2003 to 2013-2014. Four considerations drew our attention: the precipitous drop in funding allocated to our community media; the funding allocated to ethnic media; the sharp rise in advertising placements in electronic media; and the communications strategies.*

The Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada investigated and a preliminary report was published in 2016. This report provides a clear, precise and informative historical overview of the current financial situation of French language media in Ontario, as well as a precise description of the obligations of the Government of Canada regarding French language advertising aimed at minority communities, which is meant to ensure they are adequately informed as well as to support the development of minority language communities through the development of their local and regional media.

How has the situation evolved over the past ten years?
According to the data used in the Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada’s report for the 8-year period stretching from 2006-2007 to 2014-2015, Francophone newspapers in Canada’s minority language communities experienced a 78% drop in federal advertising placements, while community radio stations experienced a 73% drop. It can be assumed that this trend continued in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016. These numbers are for Canada as a whole, but it can also be assumed that Ontario’s media experienced similar reductions.

Over this same time period, the Government of Canada tripled its advertising placement on the web, which went from 5 million to 14 million $\text{.}^{6}$

The complaint submitted to the French Language Services Commissioner of Ontario also points to a major reduction in Government of Ontario advertising placement in traditional media within Ontario’s Francophone communities.

**TAX CREDIT**

In the wider context of observations drawn from all print media in Canada about the crisis faced by print media over the last several years, it appears that the tax credit designed to encourage Canadian businesses to buy local and regional advertising is also available to the Googles and Facebooks of the world.

The media industry strongly recommends narrowing the application of this tax credit, which was last revised in 1996, that is, before the impact of the web. “Basically, a business that buys ads on Facebook, Google or YouTube gets the same tax benefits as if they bought them in local media.” This is seen as a tax loophole which, if it was closed, could put “about $450 million more in the depleted coffers of media enterprises.”\text{7}

**SUPPORT PROGRAM**

A support program for community radio stations (or rather the absence of such a support program) was discussed in a report by the French Language Services Commissioner of Ontario in 2011 entitled *A Study of Ontario’s French Language Community Radio Stations: Key components of the vitality of francophone communities.*

Community radio stations began to appear in Ontario in the 1980s. Below are some key dates with regards to the establishment of a support program, followed by its abolishment.

In the 1980s, the Government of Canada created a community radio support program for the purchase of start-up equipment. This program was based on equal contributions from the government and the community.

---

• 1986 : Adoption of the French Language Services Act, which came into effect in 1989

• 1987 : The Ministry of Culture and Communication of Ontario undertook a study on community radio stations in Ontario (Kealy, Wilkinson and Associates).


• 1995 : This program was abolished following a series of government budget cutbacks.


The Commissioner’s report described the situation and strongly underlined the rationale and the necessity of community radio stations:

_In this era of globalization, instant information and media concentration in the hands of a few large corporations, community radio stations play a critical role. They build relationships with their listeners through programming that focuses on coverage of local news, community information and cultural activities that are all too often ignored by other media outlets. They are part of the communities that they serve and their tangible contributions are felt, both socially and economically._

Thereafter, the report recommended a process leading to the re-establishment of a support program.

In Quebec, where French language minority is not a factor, the government has long recognized the value of community media to widen the sphere of content available to communities. In that province, the government has put in place a program to support the operations of community media and the component of that program that is devoted to community radio provides annual support ranging from $40,000 to $60,000.

In Ontario, many community media are incorporated as private companies. Among them, only non-daily community newspapers have access to government funding. The Canada Periodical Fund has three components, two of which are directly targeted to non-daily newspapers in the private sector. The Aid to Publishers component provides funding to non-daily newspapers to help them overcome market disadvantages, while the Business Innovation component provides

---

GROUPE MÉDIA TFO

The Ontario French-language Educational Communications Authority (OFLECA), whose Francophone component is better known as Groupe Média TFO, operates the educational channel TFO and a network of 22 YouTube channels. TFO is commercial-free and is a registered charitable organization. The OFLECA is mainly funded by the Government of Ontario. Since 1997, TFO exports its signal and its content outside of Ontario and thereby earns cable distribution revenue.

SOCIÉTÉ RADIO-CANADA

Throughout the past decades, budget cuts and reduced airtime have been frequent and have had severe effects in regions.

The Government of Canada is currently reinvesting in Radio-Canada/CBC and this has allowed the corporation to acquire new resources, in particular to support its shift to digital technologies. Prior to this reinvestment, Radio-Canada/CBC experienced many rounds of budget cuts which affected activities in its Ontario stations.

DIGITAL TECHNOLOGIES

Most media enterprises have transitioned to digital technologies, but to varying degrees and at varying paces. Radio-Canada launched its ici.tou.tv services over a decade ago. Radio-Canada provides Franco-Ontarians with four regional websites, serving Toronto, northern Ontario, Ottawa-Gatineau and Windsor. These sites are continually updated day and night, practically 18 hours a day, seven days a week. In its 2015-2016 annual report and in its 2017 position statement, TFO indicates that its digital shift is resolutely underway. As for newspapers, the La Presse + model has sparked similar developments in others newspapers, such as Le Droit and the Toronto Star, to mention just those two. Quebec weeklies have launched the app Mon journal local, which groups their various online editions in a single web app.

In Ontario, the newspapers each have their own website, which can also be accessed through the Association de la presse francophone (APF) website. Similarly, radio stations are streaming their programming on their websites and also on the website tunein.com (with the exception of CFRH).

The perception among newspaper directors is that readers generally prefer to access their content in the print editions. In 2011, a study prepared by the Alliance of Official Languages Minority Media (AOLMM) noted this trend, stating that 72% of Ontario Francophones read local...
French newspapers as often or more often as they read other local newspapers, while 15% of readers access the online editions. During the consultations leading up to the publication of this White Paper, the directors of newspapers stated that they need to continue to operate both print and online editions. Therefore, in the short term, there is no gain to be made by eliminating printing costs.

**BANDWIDTH**

In Ontario, access to high bandwidth represents a challenge for both newspapers and radio stations. The issue of unequal access was raised in November 2016 by the Fédération des communautés francophones et acadienne (FCFA) during consultations with the Government of Canada on Canadian content in the digital age. The FCFA stated: “To be Francophone and to be without adequate access to high-speed Internet... is to be a minority twice over.” Many Franco-Ontarian communities are located in rural or semi-rural areas and the issue of access to adequate bandwidth was repeatedly raised with the governments of Canada and Ontario and the Canadian Radio-Television and Telecommunications Commission (CRTC). Ontario’s Francophone media might well be fully ready to make use of digital technologies, but if the consumer cannot easily access them or stream their content, the efforts and investments put into modernization will have been in vain.

**COSTS**

At this point, the profitability of digital distribution is not yet obvious. On the newspaper side, little is known of the degree of success being achieved by the digital business model. Is the leader in this field, La Presse +, currently profitable? Will it become profitable, and when? La Presse has taken the bold step of no longer publishing a print edition on weekdays, but the financial data that would allow observers to ascertain the profitability of its online edition are not publicly available.

Generally, the consumer has two expectations regarding the price to be paid for digital content. The first, according to Bryan Miles, editor of the newspaper Le Devoir, is to pay less than for the print edition (as is the case for National Geographic, for example) and the second is to pay nothing at all. In a symposium on “the impact of algorithms on media and culture” held in Lyon (France) in November 2016, Pierre Bélanger, full professor in the Department of Communications at the University of Ottawa, stated that “free content is a birthright. Along with the ‘free economy’ or the ‘sharing economy’, the entire model of basic media is being challenged.”

---

10 Alliance des médias minoritaires, Parlons Médias, 2011.
Currently, the situation for Ontario’s Francophone media, according to the directors of media organizations, is that digital platforms represent real costs, but little revenue.

CONTENT

Due to the very nature of local and regional media, their content is already well focused on their respective communities.

In recent years, major media players are searching, some for a mission, some for a niche, in order to carve out their place in the media environment, or to find new sources of revenue, which are often unrelated to their fundamental purpose. The New York Times sells “meal kits delivered to your home (...) Condé Nast, the big magazine publisher, has decided to open cafés, bars and restaurants...”13 Such activities can raise questions of conflict of interest or credibility for newspapers or magazines.

Ontario’s local and regional Francophone media, including the regional stations of national and provincial media networks, have their mission well in hand since their beginnings. Beyond national and international news, people want to hear and read about what is specific to their community, as underlined in a study by Christiane Bernier, Simon Laflamme and Sylvie Lafrenière: “We can conclude that, despite the flood of media messages coming from the majority culture, minorities, both Anglophone and Francophone, show a thirst for messages that target them, discuss their community and interpret the world in their language.”14

Some of the stakeholders who were consulted for this White Paper mentioned that local and regional media are left with local/regional content almost by default, because it is a sphere that national and provincial media have abandoned over the course of successive budget cutbacks. In actual fact, local and regional Francophone media in Ontario have always met their local and regional mandate, but nowadays, communities have increased expectations in this regard, while available resources have diminished.

How can media organizations continue to offer relevant, quality content as their revenues decline, forcing local and regional media to trim the ranks of journalists? Journalists and columnists are the people who produce the content, who are on the road (actually or virtually) and who find, evaluate and report information. Some media organizations have volunteers, but there are limits to the content a volunteer can provide, especially content which requires research and verification of sources on an ongoing basis.

Though collaborations are still few in number, we are beginning to see sharing of content between Ontario’s Francophone media. An example is provided by Le Droit and Groupe Média TFO. A weekly collaboration allows the sharing of a column that follows the Legislative Assembly, which is produced by #ONfr, a distribution platform for Groupe Médias TFO.

14 Christiane Bernier, Simon Laflamme & Sylvie Lafrenière, L’effet de la disponibilité des médias et de la densité de la population minoritaire sur la langue d’exposition aux médias; Érudit, Minorités linguistiques et société, no 3, 2013, p. 140.
Returning to the financial situation discussed above, some stakeholders proposed the creation of a federal support program devoted to journalistic content for all media. This idea was put forward during the Public Policy Forum mentioned earlier. With an annual injection of 300 to 400 million dollars, this fund would serve to “fund projects that aim to support the country's media industry and innovation in the digital age.”

Edward Greenspon, the author of the report, believes that reducing the number of journalists, at a time when multiple sources of unverified information are appearing in the public sphere, represents a threat to democracy. However, Paul Wells of the Toronto Star expressed his discomfort with the idea that journalism projects could be directly funded by the State. In our consultation session for this White Paper, participants raised this same concern and expressed the desire to depoliticize media funding.

An interesting characteristic of local and regional media is the fact that they do more than simply report what is happening in their area. They also provide visibility for emerging talents in the fields of arts, culture and journalism, giving them a public platform that helps to bring them to the attention of a wider audience later on. Because they publicize and cover events, they also promote them and they are often the only media to do so. Moreover, local and regional media are often quicker to recognize and cover a hot community issue, such as problems with French language services, school closures, etc.

An observation regarding Radio-Canada is that currently, the network’s airtime and content are not proportional to the size of Canada’s Francophone population outside of Quebec. Nonetheless, Radio-Canada produces approximately 10 hours of newscasts per week, plus one 100% local program originating from the Ottawa-Gatineau station for the entire network. The disparity is smaller on the radio side, where Radio-Canada provides more than 100 hours of original programming per week across the province of Ontario.

**MONITORING**

Independent firms that specialize in research and analysis of media consumption (consumers of print media, radio and television) base their data collection methods on the media of the majority language. The system was not designed to reflect minority language media, for which a large number of audiometers would have to be put in place in order to collect sufficient data to ensure reliable analysis. The expense would be too great for these firms and it would be financially unfeasible for the media themselves.

Nonetheless, such data would be important and useful for Ontario’s Francophone media. Some media produce their own surveys or studies of their audience or hire firms for that purpose, but the perception is that these are not independent studies.

Another area where there is no independent monitoring is the regular verification of the measures that governments take in response to the commissioners’ reports. Who will ensure regular verification of the reinstatement of government advertising placements?

---

PRIORITY ISSUES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

At the outset, there are three possible futures for local and regional media: they will disappear, survive or flourish. Francophone media in minority communities find themselves at various points on the spectrum. For example, one newspaper has ceased to publish, some newspapers and radio stations are in survival mode, some are on more solid footing, and some are flourishing. The pathways and measures proposed are useful to some and simply informational for others, but they all aim to improve the current situation.

In light of all its analyses and consultations, the Assembly hereby presents a series of recommendations on behalf of the Franco-Ontarian community to ensure the continued existence of Ontario’s Francophone media.

ADVERTISING AND FUNDING

All of the consulted media stakeholders are well aware of the facts of the matter, as it has been a topic of research, analysis and constant lobbying with both levels of government for over ten years.

The first issue is funding for Ontario’s Francophone media. There are three categories of funding: government advertising, the current tax credit, and the government support program for community radio.

Public funding for the two public broadcasters in Ontario (Radio-Canada and TFO) is part of the picture, but in a different perspective.

GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING

The Environmental Overview section of this document demonstrated the significance of changes to advertising placement by the governments of Canada and Ontario, in particular as they affect the financial situation of Ontario’s Francophone media, both public and private. It also referenced the preliminary report published by the Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada in 2016.

TFO is commercial-free and Radio-Canada is considering the possibility of eliminating advertising. The radio service of Radio-Canada is commercial-free since the 1970s and, in a brief submitted to
the minister of Canadian Heritage, Radio-Canada proposes to abandon commercial advertising on all of its platforms.\textsuperscript{16} Therefore, the following applies to private community radio stations and local, regional and provincial newspapers.

A) GOVERNMENT OF CANADA

The Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada’s report, discussing sections 11 and 30 of the Official Languages Act and the spirit of the Act, states that these two sections have a common goal: to ensure real equality, in other words, to ensure that members of an OLMC obtain, in their language and in a timely fashion, information pertaining to federal government activities and services that is equal in quality to the information provided to official language majority communities.\textsuperscript{17}

On the one hand, the previous section shows that the government now uses the internet for its advertising without any proof that online advertising reaches minority communities effectively. On the other hand, the Let’s Talk Media\textsuperscript{18} report shows that community media are widely used by members of these communities.

Any advertising strategy originating with the Government of Canada and its agencies, be it placement in traditional media or in digital media only, and that targets Canadians living in Ontario, must dedicate a representative proportion of its budget to Ontario’s Francophone media, which will transform these revenues into content distributed on the air and online in the case of radio, and in print and online in the case of newspapers.

\textbf{It is recommended that 5\% of the Government of Canada’s advertising placement budget be directed specifically to Ontario’s Francophone media if the campaign targets Ontario exclusively; and 15\% of the budget if the campaign targets all of Canada’s Francophone communities.}

\textbf{It is recommended that the Government of Canada ensure a rapid follow-up to the Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada’s report to ensure that advertising placements are reinstated as soon as possible.}

B) GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO

Although the French Language Services Commissioner of Ontario’s investigation is not yet completed, it is safe to say that the drop in advertising placement in traditional media in recent years has had a significant impact on the financial situation of Ontario’s Francophone media.

\textsuperscript{17} Commissaire aux langues officielles du Canada, \textit{Rapport préliminaire d’enquête}, septembre 2016, p. 2.
\textsuperscript{18} Alliance des médias minoritaires, \textit{Parlons Médias}, 2011.
It is recommended that 5% of the advertising budget of the Government of Ontario and its designated agencies be dedicated to Ontario’s Francophone media, which will transform these revenues into content distributed on air and online in the case of radio, and in print and online in the case of newspapers.

It is recommended that the Advertising Review Board (ARB) of Ontario adopt a policy similar to the existing ethnic media program and representative of the Francophone community’s demographic weight in Ontario (5%).

C) MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENTS

While municipalities are not subject to Ontario’s French Language Services Act, it is conceivable that, following the lead of Quebec’s municipalities, they might ask the Government of Ontario for permission to no longer publish their legal notifications through traditional media, but only online. This could result in additional revenue losses for traditional media.

It is recommended that the Assemblée de la francophonie de l’Ontario, via the Table de concertation des médias de l’Ontario, keep a close watch on the issue of advertising placement of municipal notifications when it is raised in annual general meetings of municipalities and intervene when needed.

D) TAX CREDITS

Canadian media representatives, in majority and minority communities, take exception to the fact that businesses that advertise on major search engines such as Google and Facebook can benefit from the tax credit for the purchase of local advertising. If the rule on deductions for advertising purchased in local media were revised to reflect its original intent, these businesses would no longer be able to claim the advertising tax credit and the hope would be that these advertising placements would thus return to local media. “It would surely be a significant way to help struggling media. The only question in my mind is to what extent it would be useful? Very useful? Somewhat useful? Not very useful? In any case, it would be better than the status quo.”

The Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada’s report confirms the extent to which the Government of Canada has diverted large sums towards web advertising, to the detriment of Francophone media in minority settings and the government’s legal obligation to communicate with Ontario’s Francophone population. It can therefore be assumed that such a change to the tax credit would be beneficial for these media.

It is recommended that Ontario’s Francophone media support the movement calling for the abolishment of the tax credit for local advertising as it applies to businesses that advertise on the major web platforms.

We also note that some of Ontario’s Francophone media are not sufficiently aware of this tax break, which can be claimed by businesses that buy advertising in Ontario’s local French newspapers or radio stations.

It is recommended that the Table de concertation des médias francophones, via the Assemblée de la francophonie de l’Ontario, collectively present a request for funding to develop an information campaign aimed at all Francophone media to promote the tax credit for local advertising.

GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO SUPPORT PROGRAM

Ontario currently has six French language community radio stations located in the following cities: Cornwall, Hearst, Kapuskasing, Ottawa, Penetanguishene and Toronto. The revenues that support these organizations come from government advertising, local advertising and volunteer fundraising (radio-thons, bingos, etc.).

In communities where the demographic weight of the Francophone minority is weaker, the revenue potential of local advertising is weaker as well. However, these same communities are those where the presence of a Francophone community radio station is most important to actualize the presence of the French language.

The following recommendation regarding the support program is based on the program currently in place in Quebec.

Ontario can and should re-establish its program quickly. There would be no unfair competition with private radio, because nowhere in Ontario does a private radio station operate where a community radio station is present (for example, in the Ottawa area, the private Francophone radio stations are located in Quebec). The program would at least stabilize the operations of community radio stations. The directors of community radio stations warn that their volunteers are exhausted and that with such a program, their staff (sometimes just a single employee) would gain a modicum of support to recruit and train new volunteers as they continue to deliver on-air content as required by their broadcast license.
It is recommended that a financial support program be put in place with ten years of guaranteed funding with a possibility of renewal.

- For the existing radio stations, the program would provide an annual operating budget of $50,000 indexed annually to the cost of living.

- For emerging radio projects, the program would provide $100,000 in the start-up year in order to leverage the Government of Canada’s start-up grant. Thereafter, the radio stations would receive an annual grant of $50,000 indexed annually to the cost of living.

Like not-for-profit radio stations, privately owned radio stations and community newspapers also play an essential role in the community. All these types of media uphold a local and community mandate, help to expand the Francophone environment and discuss issues that larger media ignore.

The directors of privately owned Francophone media in Ontario contend that as a result of reduced government advertising, their business model is hardly sustainable. In recognition of the role that private media play in Ontario’s Francophone communities, an emergency fund would help to ensure the stability of these businesses at a time of change in the media environment.

It is recommended that the Government of Ontario create an emergency fund for Franco-Ontarian community media that have experienced a drop in revenue and ensure it remain available until government advertising returns.

GROUPE MÉDIA TFO AND SOCIÉTÉ RADIO-CANADA

A) GROUPE MÉDIA TFO

The Ontario French language Educational Communications Authority (OFLECA, better known as Groupe Média TFO) has recently published online a strategic positioning statement that serves as a source document for this White Paper.

One of the issues raised by Groupe Media TFO in its statement is the current funding model used by the Government of Ontario. TFO has made a major shift to digital technologies and has changed its corporate culture, yet the government’s funding model has remained unchanged. The model used to fund traditional educational television seems obsolete in a context where content has expanded across several digital platforms. “Under the current funding model, there is little if any room for Groupe Média TFO to continue to achieve further progress as a digital leader [...] This has put a damper on the organization’s capacity to fully realize its potential for innovation.”

In light of the feedback obtained in preparing this White Paper, increased funding aimed exclusively...
at the needs and realities of the Franco-Ontarian community would enrich the current media offer. There is a perception that TFO is devoting a lot of its resources to marketing that aims to attract Quebec audiences. It has been suggested that this perception be dealt with and/or that marketing resources be redeployed towards the Francophone market in Ontario.

It is recommended that the Government of Ontario provide funding to TFO for multi-platform projects produced by and for the Franco-Ontarian community, as well as funding directed exclusively to the promotion (both traditional and digital) of TFO in Ontario.

B) SOCIÉTÉ RADIO-CANADA

Two recent events are of interest for this White Paper. The first is that the Government of Canada has recently directed considerable sums to the CBC/SRC, including funds to be used to improve regional services ($75M), and this funding will be doubled in subsequent years.

It is recommended that Radio-Canada allocate 15% of this funding envelope to its Francophone regional stations outside of Quebec.

The second event is Radio-Canada’s expressed desire to eliminate on-air (television) advertising, with compensation from the Government of Canada to make up for this lost revenue. This is great news for Francophone minority communities. It is a fact that when a network includes advertising in its broadcasts, its mission is to deliver viewers to advertisers. But where is the largest concentration of Francophone viewers to be found? Because the great mass of Francophone viewers is in Montreal, it follows that content overwhelmingly targets Montrealers, for both the Première and RDI channels.

Freed from the burden of commercial imperatives linked to the sale of advertising, Radio-Canada and RDI will be able to function as resources for minority Francophone communities and to better serve, in fair proportion, the entire population covered by their mandate.

It is recommended that advertising be abolished in Radio-Canada and RDI broadcasts and that they receive compensatory funding.

In the event that advertising is abolished in Radio-Canada Première and RDI broadcasts, it is recommended that 15% of their respective budgets and airtime be devoted to Canadian Francophone communities outside of Quebec, half of which are in Ontario.

COMMUNITY TELEVISION

In three Ontario communities, residents have access to a French language community television station. These communities are Ottawa (Rogers), Rockland (Vidéotron) and Hawkesbury (Cogeco Cable). The Rogers and Cogeco stations are managed directly by the cable companies, but
the Vidéotron station is incorporated as an independent community television organization with its own board of directors, while remaining in the fold of Vidéotron.

The funding model for community television stations is regulated by the CRTC. Smaller systems receive 5% of the cable revenue in the community television’s area; this is the case for Hawkesbury and Rockland. The larger systems, like Ottawa’s, will receive 1.5% as of September 1st, 2017. In the past, these systems received 2% of the cable revenue in their respective areas.

Community television stations in minority markets play an important role in the sharing of content that relates directly to their communities, which larger networks cannot include. They also serve as incubators for on-air and technical talent. Many producers trace their first professional experience back to community television and the same can be said for emerging artists. Community television and community radio are similar in this respect.

It is recommended that the CRTC return to the funding formula of 2% of cable distribution revenues for community television stations related to larger cable systems.

It is recommended that cable companies that operate community television stations in Ontario provide funding for an annual promotional campaign aimed at Francophone communities in Ontario in order to increase the participation of Francophones in community television across the province.
DIGITAL TECHNOLOGIES

The stakeholders who took part in our consultations agree that the full shift to digital technologies is inevitable. Consumers of all ages have made the switch to gain access to content anytime and anywhere on the platform of their choice. Digital content must therefore be simple to access, especially for young people and people on the move.

The challenge of the digital shift from a material and functional point of view is not the participants’ lack of will, but rather the lack of funding and human resources, be it for community newspapers, radio stations or television stations. For all these media, access to wide bandwidth is vital to the success of their digital shift.

BANDWIDTH

In 2016, the Government of Canada held a consultation on Canadian content in a digital world, in which the Fédération des communautés francophones et acadienne (FCFA) took part. In its brief, the FCFA states: “Whether it’s content, culture or access, Canada will not be a true leader in the digital sphere until connectivity problems, especially in rural or distant areas, have been solved.”

The FCFA’s brief recommends that “the Government of Canada raise the targets for connectivity in the short term and long term, to 25 Mbp/s for download and 3 Mbp/s for upload.”

Recently, the Canadian Radio-television and Telecommunications Commission (CRTC) declared that wide bandwidth internet access is now considered an essential service. The Commission recommends that download speeds of 50 Mbp/s and upload speeds of 10Mbp/s be attained over the next 10 to 15 years.

It is recommended that the CRTC ensure a capacity of 25 Mbp/s and 5 Mbp/s across Canada over a five year timeline.

It is recommended that the CRTC maintain its commitment to ensure 50/10 capacity within 10 to 15 years.

---

21 Mémoire de la Fédération des communautés francophones et Acadienne (FCFA) du Canada, 2016, p.7
22 Ibid., p.9.
BRIDGE FUNDING

Offering digital content is essential for all media, but it brings little financial benefit at this time. In our consultations, the stakeholders were of the view that if government advertising (Canadian and Ontarian) were reinstated, the costs of maintaining the offer of quality digital content could be absorbed in the mid-term.

However, there would still be a time gap between the pressing need to complete the full digital shift and the local and regional media’s return to financial health thanks to the return of government advertising.

It is recommended that a request be made to the Government of Canada for bridge funding equivalent to one half-time salary for all local and regional media organizations, so that they can offer up-to-date and enriched digital content, and that this funding be maintained as long as government advertising placements have not resumed.

DISCOVERABILITY

The digital shift is essential, but simply being on the web is not enough; you also need to be found. Today, and even more so tomorrow, web content is growing at an exponential rate. Though this universe is accessible to all, the discovery of content is directed by search engines like Google and filters like Facebook, which suggest content based on our tastes and our consumption history.

The challenge of discoverability is an emerging issue and it was the topic of a symposium mentioned earlier. A participant in that symposium was Sylvain Lafrance, former vice-president of French programming at Radio-Canada, who spearheaded the creation of tou.tv and who is today the director of media studies at Hautes Études Commerciales in Montreal. In his opinion, “the issue of content discoverability [is] all the more sensitive because most internet users are unaware of the role of ‘digital sherpas’ played by search engines and believe that the internet is neutral.”

It is recommended that the Government of Canada fund a traveling training workshop on the role of algorithms and the issue of discoverability as it is, or will be, experienced by our French language media.

---

CONTENT

This issue highlights the great strength that characterizes Ontario’s local and regional French language media, namely that they are already well focused on their own clientele by their very purpose.

Content is king. This statement is repeated in many documents and briefs, including The Digital Puzzle: Piecing Back Together the Content Value Chain, a research report by the Canada Media Fund. This report discusses television production, but its observations on content, value creation, linear distribution and non linear distribution apply to all other media. After all, what is the consumer looking for, if not content? Content can be adapted to many platforms, but ultimately, all platforms want to offer content. “But one thing is certain: content will be at the centre of where the industry goes from here. And those who own and control the content will help steer the direction,” says The Boston Consulting Group in The Value of Content (2016), as quoted in The Digital Puzzle. The content of Francophone media is well focused on the communities they serve, and that constitutes a definite advantage.

Several participants raised this question: how to approach and attract young people who are hooked on social media? In a minority setting, this question is twofold: how to raise their interest for local and regional content, and for French content on top of that. Both of these aspects are tools to encourage people to identify with their community. Professor Rodrigue Landry discusses this topic in many of his writings. His research paper Langue publique et langue privée en milieu ethnolinguistique minoritaire (public language and private language in minority ethno-linguistic environments), explains that the media play a bridging role between a student’s private language (at home, at school) and the public language, the language of the linguistic majority, that is, the language of social status, “and that contacts with French language media (contacts that are both private and public) are associated with the desire to integrate with Francophone community.”

This role that media can play is central to integrating young people into the Franco-Ontarian community and perhaps media and schools are not exploiting it as fully as they should.

A number of newspapers and radio stations already include reports on school activities and some are even presenting content produced by students.

It is recommended that the media adopt a more structured approach to including young people in content production and digital distribution (podcasts, Twitter, etc.). Many participants suggested that such projects be created with direct links to the Ontario Ministry of Education’s Aménagement linguistique (language management) policy.

It should be noted that in August 2016, TFO launched its platform onproduit.ca, which hosts local

25 The Boston Consulting Group, The Value of Content, tel que cité dans le rapport, 2016.
It is recommended that the French language education division of the Ministry of Education create a joint working group (media, schools and Ministry) to stimulate the consumption of Francophone content by young people and encourage them to take part in the development of content for traditional and social media.

It is recommended that the above joint working group develop a project to include the use of local and regional Francophone media in curriculum guidelines and as part of the Aménagement linguistique policy in Ontario’s Francophone elementary and secondary schools.

According to participants in our consultations, especially the participants who are responsible for journalism programs, a key strategy is to encourage more Francophone high school graduates to enroll in post-secondary media programs. These participants are worried by declining enrolment in these programs. On the one hand, quality journalism is good for democracy. On the other hand, given the budget cuts across all media, young people might think that journalism is not a promising career. A federal fund to support journalistic projects could help to reverse the exodus from the profession, even though this raises the issue of politicizing media funding.

It is recommended that the governments of Canada and Ontario create an employment program specifically aimed at encouraging students in the final years of high school and at the post-secondary level to gain work experience in the media.

It is recommended that Ontario’s Francophone media support the movement calling on the Government of Canada to create a journalism fund.

As for the question of collaboration, it presents potential and opportunities.
It is recommended to explore the funding and purchase of a mobile app that would serve as a single point of entry where online consumers could easily access their local and regional media options.

In communities served by both a local/regional newspaper and a community radio, the directors of these media could consider ways to find synergies, if they are not yet doing so. In minority situations, the more choices and sources there are, the more people use French language services. The creation of new Francophone schools is an example. The less choices there are, the more easily clients turn to the default option offered by Anglophone providers. When a news story is disseminated by two or three local/regional Francophone media, its visibility increases and this reinforces the role of Francophone media as an integrating influence in the community.

It is recommended that in communities served by more than one local/regional media, concrete approaches to collaboration be developed to extend the reach of their shared content. This sort of collaboration could extend to media at the provincial level in some cases, where needed.

MONITORING

Who are the consumers of various media? How many of them are there? What do they do?

Beyond their target clientele, it is important for any media organization to know who their actual clients are and to what extent they consume the media product, when, on which platform, how often? Etc.

However, independent audience measurement processes are not designed to define and measure these factors adequately in a minority setting. Some media conduct their own occasional surveys or make do with the results of the poorly adapted methods used by large measurement firms. In both cases, the findings are doubtful, or at least they are perceived to be doubtful.

Ontario’s Francophone media have the right and the need to have answers to these questions.
Another area where the need for monitoring is felt is the follow-up actions that are taken or will be taken in response to the reports of both language commissioners on the advertising placement policies of both levels of government. Who, in fact, is able to monitor government advertising in Ontario’s Francophone media on an annual basis?

It is recommended that a neutral Observatory, comprising a board of directors and a small team and funded by the Government of Canada via Canadian Heritage, be created to ensure audience/readership measurement and the monitoring of the reinstatement of government advertising.

The first mandate of such an observatory would be to create/adapt methods and means of analyzing the Francophone audience and readership in minority settings, to carry out or to commission research, and to analyze the data on an annual basis.

Its second mandate would be to monitor government advertising placements and to report on them twice a year.
CONCLUSION

The research papers, articles and reports referred to in this White Paper clearly confirm the purpose of Francophone media in minority communities. The briefs, interviews and consultations leading up to this White Paper show the will, or rather the determination, of individuals and organizations to reflect the local realities of Ontario’s Francophone community, realities that no majority or national media has the means or the desire to reflect in the course of everyday life for Francophones in minority communities. Ontario’s Francophone newspapers, radio stations and television stations ensure a presence and provide vital links to the collective identity of Franco-Ontarians.

Unlike health and education services, are Francophone media services viewed as a “luxury” by the governments of Canada and Ontario, thus justifying their disengagement? Many observations have emerged from the work leading up to this White Paper. One of them is that Ontario’s Francophones are loyal to their local and regional Francophone media. Therefore, those media are the ideal way to communicate with them. A second observation is that legislation and policies have established the government’s obligation to ensure that minority communities will not just survive, but also flourish through their institutions.

The minority communities’ media are certainly an integral part of their institutional structure. In that sense, their situation differs from the situation of the majority communities’ media in many respects. The solutions to their problems must take these differences into account.

If advertising placements targeting Canada’s Francophone communities were directed to local and regional media in minority Francophone settings, these media would have a solid base upon which to continue their contributions to the development of the communities they serve. Possibly, and even probably, new local and regional media would be established in smaller communities that up to now cannot hear or see themselves in any media.

The list of Francophone media annexed to this document is impressive, but there are still regions where Francophones remain invisible and inaudible in public life. Moreover, many of these communities are in a fragile state. Five years from now, will the list be much shorter?
ANNEX 1

Daily newspaper
• Le Droit – Ottawa (1913)  www.ledroit.com

Weekly and bi-weekly newspapers
• Le Carillon – Hawkesbury (1947)  www.editionap.ca
• Le Goût de vivre – Lafontaine/Penetanguishene (1972)  www.legoutdevivre.com
• Le Journal de Cornwall – Cornwall (1977)  www.editionap.ca
• Le Métropolitain – Toronto GTA (1993)  www.lemetropolitain.com
• Le Nord – Hearst (1976)  www.lejournallenord.com
• Le Reflet – Embrun (1986) ; journal bilingue  www.editionap.ca
• Le Régional – Niagara (1999)  www.leregional.com
• Le Rempart – Windsor (1966)  www.lerempart.ca
• Le Voyageur – Sudbury (1968)  www.lavoixdunord.ca
• L’Express – Toronto (1976)  www.lexpress.to
• Tribune Express – Hawkesbury (1994); journal bilingue  www.editionap.ca

Monthly, bi-monthly and periodical newspapers
• L’Action – Centre/Sud-Ouest (2003)  www.laction.ca
• L’Orléanois – Orléans (2016)

Student newspapers
• La Rotonde – Université d’Ottawa (1932)  www.larotonde.ca
• L’Original déchaîné – Université Laurentienne (1987)  www.loriginaldechaine.ca
• Pro Tem – Collège Glendon (1962); journal bilingue  www.protemgl.com

**Community radio stations**


The Mouvement des intervenants en communications radio de l’Ontario (MICRO) is an umbrella organization for all these stations, except Toronto.  www.microontario.ca

**Student radio stations**

- CFRL – Collège La Cité  www.collegelacite.ca
- CHRY – Université de York / Collège Glendon; radio bilingue  www.radioglendon.ca
- CHUO – Université d’Ottawa; radio bilingue  www.chuo.fm

**Private radio stations**

- CHYC FM – Sudbury, Timmins et Nipissing  www.leloupfm.com

**Radio-Canada’s radio stations in Ontario**

(sans publicité en ondes)  www.ici.radio-canada.ca

- Ottawa/Gatineau
- Sudbury
- Toronto
- Windsor

4 morning radio programs (Ottawa-Gatineau, Toronto, Windsor and Sudbury)
3 afternoon radio programs (Ottawa-Gatineau, inter. Toronto-Windsor and Sudbury)
2 Saturday morning radio programs (produced in Sudbury for Ontario, and an Ottawa-Gatineau program)
Regional newscasts in every station at various times in the daily schedule from morning to evening, 7 days a week.

**Community television stations**
- Télévision communautaire de Hawkesbury – Câble 11 (Hawkesbury)  
  [www.tvcogeco.com/hawkesbury](http://www.tvcogeco.com/hawkesbury)
- Télévision communautaire de Rockland – TVC22 (Rockland)  [www.tvc22.ca](http://www.tvc22.ca)
- Télévision Rogers – Câble 23 (Ottawa)  [www.rogerstv.com](http://www.rogerstv.com)

**Provincial television stations**
- **TFO**  [www.tfo.org](http://www.tfo.org)
  TFO’s headquarters are in Toronto and there are two satellite offices in Ontario, one in Ottawa and the other in Sudbury. TFO broadcasts 18 hours a day and rebroadcasts its programs at night. The programming includes original productions, co-productions and acquisitions. There is no on-air advertising.
- **La Société Radio-Canada (SRC)**  [www.ici.radio-canada.ca](http://www.ici.radio-canada.ca)
  SRC Toronto; has on-air advertising  
  SRC Ottawa-Gatineau; has on-air advertising  
  2 newscasts at 6 PM. (60 min. for Ottawa-Gatineau and 30 min. for the Ontario edition produced in Toronto. The Ontario newscast is rebroadcasted at 11 PM in Ottawa-Gatineau.)  
  2 30-minute newscasts on Saturday and Sunday (Ottawa-Gatineau and Ontario)  
  4 morning radio programs (Ottawa-Gatineau, Toronto, Windsor and Sudbury)  
  3 afternoon radio programs (Ottawa-Gatineau, inter. Toronto-Windsor and Sudbury)  
  2 Saturday morning radio programs (produced in Sudbury for Ontario, and an Ottawa-Gatineau program)  
  Regional newscasts in every station at various times in the daily schedule from morning to evening, 7 days a week.
- **TVA**  [www.tva.ca](http://www.tva.ca)
  The TVA network obtained a national license from the CRTC in 1998, which includes mandatory distribution. As required by its original license, TVA produces a weekly half-hour program (through independent producers) and covers six Francophone events per year outside of Quebec. TVA has no offices outside of Quebec.
- **Unis TV**  [www.unis.ca](http://www.unis.ca)
  The TV5 Quebec-Canada / Unis channel serves regions outside of Montreal and is distributed across Canada. It has a representative based in Toronto. A condition of its license is that 60% of its production budgets must target minority Francophone communities. According to TV5-Unis, 20 to 25% of its programming is Franco-Ontarian in nature.
ANNEX 2 - RECOMMANDATIONS

ADVERTISING AND FUNDING

1. It is recommended that 5% of the Government of Canada’s advertising placement budget be directed specifically to Ontario’s Francophone media if the campaign targets Ontario exclusively; and 15% of the budget if the campaign targets all of Canada’s Francophone communities.

2. It is recommended that the Government of Canada ensure a rapid follow-up to the Commissioner of Official Languages of Canada’s report to ensure that advertising placements are reinstated as soon as possible.

3. It is recommended that 5% of the advertising budget of the Government of Ontario and its designated agencies be dedicated to Ontario’s Francophone media, which will transform these revenues into content distributed on air and online in the case of radio, and in print and online in the case of newspapers.

4. It is recommended that the Advertising Review Board (ARB) of Ontario adopt a policy similar to the existing ethnic media program and representative of the Francophone community’s demographic weight in Ontario (5%).

5. It is recommended that the Assemblée de la francophonie de l’Ontario, via the Table de concertation des médias de l’Ontario, keep a close watch on the issue of advertising placement of municipal notifications when it is raised in annual general meetings of municipalities and intervene when needed.

6. It is recommended that Ontario’s Francophone media support the movement calling for the abolishment of the tax credit for local advertising as it applies to businesses that advertise on the major web platforms.

7. It is recommended that the Table de concertation des médias francophones, via the Assemblée de la francophonie de l’Ontario, collectively present a request for funding to develop an information campaign aimed at all Francophone media to promote the tax credit for local advertising.

8. It is recommended that a financial support program be put in place with ten years of guaranteed funding with a possibility of renewal. For the existing radio stations, the program would provide an annual operating budget of $50,000 indexed annually to cost of living. For emerging radio projects, the program would provide $100,000 in the start-up year in order to leverage the Government of Canada’s start-up grant. Thereafter, the radio stations would receive an annual grant of $50,000 indexed annually to the cost of living.
9. It is recommended that the Government of Ontario create an emergency fund for Franco-Ontarian community media that have experienced a drop in revenue and ensure it remain available until government advertising returns.

10. It is recommended that the Government of Ontario provide funding to TFO for multi-platform projects produced by and for the Franco-Ontarian community, as well as funding directed exclusively to the promotion (both traditional and digital) of TFO in Ontario.

11. It is recommended that Radio-Canada allocate 15% of this funding envelope to its Francophone regional stations outside of Quebec.

12. It is recommended that advertising be abolished in Radio-Canada and RDI broadcasts and that they receive compensatory funding.

13. In the event that advertising is abolished in Radio-Canada Première and RDI broadcasts, it is recommended that 15% of their respective budgets and airtime be devoted to Canadian Francophone communities outside of Quebec, half of which are in Ontario.

14. It is recommended that the CRTC return to the funding formula of 2% of cable distribution revenues for community television stations related to larger cable systems.

15. It is recommended that cable companies that operate community television stations in Ontario provide funding for an annual promotional campaign aimed at Francophone communities in Ontario in order to increase the participation of Francophones in community television across the province.

**DIGITAL TECHNOLOGIES**

16. It is recommended that the CRTC ensure a capacity of 25 Mbp/s and 5 Mbp/s across Canada over a five year timeline.

17. It is recommended that the CRTC maintain its commitment to ensure 50/10 capacity within 10 to 15 years.

18. It is recommended that a request be made to the Government of Canada for bridge funding equivalent to one half-time salary for all local and regional media organizations, so that they can offer up-to-date and enriched digital content, and that this funding be maintained as long as government advertising placements have not resumed.

19. It is recommended that the Government of Canada fund a traveling training workshop on the role of algorithms and the issue of discoverability as it is, or will be, experienced by our French language media.
CONTENT

20. It is recommended that the media adopt a more structured approach to including young people in content production and digital distribution (podcasts, Twitter, etc.). Many participants suggested that such projects be created with direct links to the Ontario Ministry of Education’s Aménagement linguistique (language management) policy.

21. It is recommended that the French language education division of the Ministry of Education create a joint working group (media, schools and Ministry) to stimulate the consumption of Francophone content by young people and encourage them to take part in the development of content for traditional and social media.

22. It is recommended that the above joint working group develop a project to include the use of local and regional Francophone media in curriculum guidelines and as part of the Aménagement linguistique policy in Ontario’s Francophone elementary and secondary schools.

23. It is recommended that the governments of Canada and Ontario create an employment program specifically aimed at encouraging students in the final years of high school and at the post-secondary level to gain work experience in the media.

24. It is recommended that Ontario’s Francophone media support the movement calling on the Government of Canada to create a journalism fund.

25. It is recommended to explore the funding and purchase of a mobile app that would serve as a single point of entry where online consumers could easily access their local and regional media options.

26. It is recommended that in communities served by more than one local/regional media, concrete approaches to collaboration be developed to extend the reach of their shared content. This sort of collaboration could extend to media at the provincial level in some cases, where needed.

MONITORING

27. It is recommended that a neutral Observatory, comprising a board of directors and a small team and funded by the Government of Canada via Canadian Heritage, be created to ensure audience/readership measurement and the monitoring of the reinstatement of government advertising.
ANNEX 3 – SOURCES

Reports


Articles


• Bob Cox & Edward Greenspon, « Journalism needs a plan to save the news », Toronto Star, 10 mars 2017.


Research papers

• Christiane Bernier, Simon Laflamme & Sylvie Lafrenière, L’effet de la disponibilité des médias et de la densité de la population minoritaire sur la langue d’exposition aux médias, Érudit, Minorités linguistiques et société, no 3, 2013, p. 120-143.
